

MEMORANDUM



Date: April 21, 2025

To: Lisa M. Ramundo
Department of Public Works Commissioner
Albany County

From: Angelo Trichilo, PE
Project Manager
Creighton Manning Engineering, LLP

Project: Project No. 23-C583 (Bid #2025-061)
CR2 (Cole Hill Road) over Fox Creek Bridge Replacement Project
Town of East Berne, Albany County

Re: Recommendation for Award

The subject project was let for construction on April 10, 2025, with five (5) bids received and opened at the Albany County Purchasing Office, 112 State Street, Room 820, Albany, NY at 11:00 AM. The engineer's estimate for the project was **\$1,798,000.00** and the following bids were received and reviewed:

Bidders in Rank Order:

Rank	Bidder Name	Total Bid as Received	Total Bid as Checked
1	Diversified Wireless Inc.	\$1,523,823.19	\$1,523,823.19
2	Winn Construction Services Inc.	\$1,542,139.00	\$1,542,139.00
3	Wm. J Keller & Sons	\$1,578,527.00	\$1,545,444.00
4	Rifenburg Construction, Inc.	\$1,664,115.00	\$1,664,115.00
5	James H. Maloy, Inc	\$1,894,000.00	\$1,894,000.00

The bid was reviewed and checked, and all computations were verified by Angelo Trichilo, Project Manager, Creighton Manning Engineering, LLP on April 14, 2025. As discussed in section 15 of the Project Manual, bids were evaluated, as a minimum, according to the following criteria:

- Lowest total bid cost and projected timetable for completion of services and/or delivery of goods described herein
- Completeness of the bid
- Bidder's demonstrated capabilities and professional qualifications [see section 7.4]
7.4 All bidders must document five (5) or more years in the business of providing bridge work experience similar in size and scope to this project.

The lowest bid of \$1,523,823.19 as submitted by Diversified Wireless Inc. was reviewed and found to have two line-item multiplication errors in the bid tabulation (items 555.09 and 568.70), but the bid total matched correctly with the unit prices bid (criteria a). The bid documentation was found to be incomplete, missing the Required Apprenticeship Training Documentation (criteria b). Additionally, the bidder did not demonstrate significant experience with similar projects for cost and type of work. As stated above, bidders were to document five (5) or more years in the business of providing bridge work experience similar in size and scope to this project, which was not provided. Question 3 of the Bidders Qualification Questionnaire also offers

MEMORANDUM

bidders an opportunity to list example projects they have done of a similar nature to this project, specifically calling out "bridge rehabilitation" work. Of the 5 example projects provided by the bidder for this question, none were bridge projects. Creighton Manning contacted 3 of the references with information listed for these projects to gain additional information. Although all references spoke positively of the bidder's construction experience and with construction access and site civil related work, none discussed any prior bridge experience with the bidder. Lastly, question 4 also discusses projects the bidder is currently working on, and none of those projects provided discuss bridge experience either. Therefore, the bidder has not demonstrated the capabilities and professional qualifications required to complete this project (criteria c).

Based on the bid documents submitted by Diversified Wireless, Creighton Manning recommends that Diversified Wireless is not the lowest, qualified, experienced, and responsible bidder.

The second lowest bid of \$1,542,139.00 as submitted by Winn Construction Services, Inc. was reviewed and found to be accurate regarding bid tabulation (criteria a). The bid documentation was found to be incomplete, missing the Required Apprenticeship Training Documentation (criteria b). Winn Construction Services, Inc. was contacted and provided the missing Apprenticeship Training Documentation in a timely manner to complete their bid, and their qualifications are satisfactorily demonstrated. The bidder demonstrated numerous bridge and bridge-related project experiences and qualifications, including projects within Albany County, with contacts, costs, dates, and locations of every project (criteria c).

Based upon the foregoing, the lowest, qualified, experienced, and responsible bidder was determined to be **Winn Construction Services Inc.** with a total bid of **\$1,542,139.00**.

Based upon the foregoing bid results, I, acting on behalf of Creighton Manning Engineering, LLP, recommend Albany County:

- (X) Award the contract to the lowest responsible bidder **Winn Construction Services Inc.** for the total bid amount of **\$1,542,139.00**.
- () Reject all bids

Dated : 2025-04-21

Signature : Angelo Trichilo
Angelo Trichilo, PE